

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 1, PAGE NO 4**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Is it a GSE appointment?

GEORGINA HARRISSON: I will need to take that on notice.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that provisions regarding the employment of the TAFE NSW Managing Director are set out in section 3 and section 5 of Schedule 1A of the *TAFE Commission Act*.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 2, PAGE NO 10**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: And if there are any leave components to that.

JULIE TICKLE: I think leave is a matter for the person. I would have to make sure that we are procedurally correct in providing people's personal details.

**ANSWER**

I am advised the answer to this question was provided in the afternoon hearing and can be found on page 46 on the official transcript.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 3, PAGE NO 15**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: In the meantime, I will ask some questions. Ms Tickle, I understand that Mr Faurby received a bump up in his pay on 1 July from \$575,000 to \$589,500. Is that correct?

JULIE TICKLE: I would have to check the amount, but it was under the SOORT determination for the blanket across sector increase. If that contributes to that increase, then yes. The SOORT determination determines that, and that was applied to all of the executives.

**ANSWER**

I am advised Mr Faurby's remuneration package from 1 July 2021 is included in the Statutory and Other Offices Remuneration Tribunal (SOORT) 2021 Determination for Public Service Senior Executives.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 4, PAGE NO 15**

JULIE TICKLE: In this circumstance we worked with the Department of Education as the cluster lead to trigger the next set of processes, which included determining what the amount was. It went to payroll, was calculated and Mr Faurby was advised and paid in the next pay run.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Who actually advised you?

JULIE TICKLE: On the day? It was one of my colleagues from Department of Education who I spoke to early on the day. I do not recall the person's name but I could certainly provide that on notice.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Can you recall their position?

JULIE TICKLE: It was somebody in People and Culture, but the name is just slipping my mind right now.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that Ms Tickle spoke with the Acting Executive Director HR Operations at the Department of Education.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 5, PAGE NO 24**

The CHAIR: What is that, 1 per cent of the Commonwealth budget? Can you get an answer to that on notice?

HUGH DURRANT-WHYTE: No, I can tell you what the Federal budget is, actually. In the Australian Research Council [ARC], it is \$1.8 billion a year, and the NCRIS facility over 10 years is \$4.2 billion.

The CHAIR: And all the other science agencies? Perhaps, on notice, we could get an outline of the make-up of the \$37 million State contribution compared to all the Commonwealth funding.

HUGH DURRANT-WHYTE: Yes, I have that here.

The CHAIR: Okay, maybe you could table that for our benefit and we can look at it. But what is the \$37 million as a percentage, roughly?

HUGH DURRANT-WHYTE: Of the Commonwealth?

The CHAIR: Of the total Commonwealth spend on science and technology, which obviously runs into many billions.

HUGH DURRANT-WHYTE: I will have to take that on notice.

The CHAIR: Okay, you can take that you notice.

**ANSWER**

The NSW Government collects data on its research and development (R&D) investment and R&D-related activity through the Waratah Research Network. In 2018-19, the NSW Government invested at least \$386 million to support R&D and innovation (noting this investment was underreported). In the same year, the Commonwealth Government invested almost \$10 billion to support innovation, science and research.

Using the underreported 2018-19 figure of \$386 million, the NSW Government contributed 4 per cent of what the Commonwealth Government committed for that same year.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 6, PAGE NO 26**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Ms Tickle, are you able to provide on notice the value of all contracts that have been awarded to EY by TAFE for the last five years and the same for Deloitte?

JULIE TICKLE: Yes, we would be able to provide that on notice.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: The cumulative value. Yes, on notice, thank you.

JULIE TICKLE: Yes. Can I check what you are after? Deloitte and EY?

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Deloitte and EY, the cumulative value of the contracts that they been awarded in TAFE over the past five years.

JULIE TICKLE: Yes, we can take that question on notice.

**ANSWER**

The expenditure with Deloitte and EY included both Opex and Capex comprised of IT services, business management and advisory services, consulting, internal audit services and market research (economic modelling data).

Summary of expenditure (ex. GST):

Deloitte:

FY17 - \$ 2,382,530  
FY18 - \$ 4,576,588  
FY19 - \$ 13,330,998  
FY20 - \$ 16,519,945  
FY21 - \$ 13,038,779

EY:

FY17 - \$ 778,254  
FY18 - \$ 2,207,490  
FY19 - \$ 3,619,471  
FY20 - \$ 3,560,362  
FY21 - \$ 442,542

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 7, PAGE NO 32**

Mr ALISTER HENSKENS: Mr Shoebridge, there has been a huge amount of organisational change within that period, and I would need to look at—which I confess I have not done a deep analysis since 2017 to 2021—why that change has occurred. It is all very well you sprouting numbers, but I think you need to look at the underlying reasons for the change in the numbers, and that is something that I would need to look at.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Will you look at it? You said you will not look at the managing director exiting. You were not interested in checking out why the seat was warm. Will you look at what on earth has gone wrong in TAFE that has seen a doubling in the number of chief executives?

Mr ALISTER HENSKENS: This is where there is obviously a logical disconnect between—

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: I accept the Coalition likes chief executives.

Mr ALISTER HENSKENS: —your thought processes, Mr Shoebridge.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: You like chief executives. We like teachers.

Mr ALISTER HENSKENS: There are still 31, on your proposition, senior executives in place. There is no longer the former managing director in place. It is a completely different exercise, and I will have a look at it.

**ANSWER**

The number of senior executives reporting to the Managing Director as at 30 June in any given year is reported in the relevant TAFE NSW Annual Report.

I am advised that in the 2020-2021 financial year, TAFE NSW began employing and transitioning senior executives as Public Service Senior Executives (PSSEs) under section 39 of the GSE Act. These senior executives are included in the 31 reported as at 30 June 2021 in the Annual Report. This figure excludes those senior executives employed under the *TAFE Commission Act* not reporting to the Managing Director.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 8, PAGE NO 32**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Ms Tickle, can you provide the number of staff who are earning that equivalent not only for this financial year but for the past five financial years, so we can see where the trend is happening?

JULIE TICKLE: I believe the number that Mr Brady mentioned to the Committee before is the accurate number of people employed at a salary equivalent or above the public sector senior executive level. That is 108 at 30 June 2021. The other numbers in the previous financial years we will take on notice.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that the number of TAFE NSW staff remunerated at SES equivalent salaries for the last five financial years as at 30 June is as follows:

<b>2017*</b>	<b>2018</b>	<b>2019</b>	<b>2020</b>	<b>2021</b>
60	119	114	108	108

\*2017 pre-dates many of the One TAFE organisational changes, including the establishment of state-wide leadership, management and service coordination functions that were previously undertaken by individual Institutes or the Department of Education such as IT, Finance, HR, Legal, Marketing, Procurement and Infrastructure.



**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 7, PAGE NO 41**

Mr ALISTER HENSKENS: Mr Shoebridge, as I said previously, I would need to go back and look into the history of the organisation back to 2017 to understand what has achieved that result. As I have made very clear, I am focused on the future of this organisation, not going over the entrails of ancient history.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: I know that it is embarrassing.

Mr ALISTER HENSKENS: If you want me to do that, I am happy to do it. I will take it on notice and I will do it, but that has not been my focus.

**ANSWER**

Refer to response Budget Estimates transcript question 7, page number 32 for information regarding TAFE NSW senior executives.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 7, PAGE NO 42**

Mr ALISTER HENSKENS: ... That may be an explanation for why the numbers have gone up in the way that you have described, but I would need to get advice on that. I would need to have a look at it. I am merely hypothesising that that could be one explanation for it.

**ANSWER**

Refer to response Budget Estimates transcript question 7, page number 32 for information regarding TAFE NSW senior executives.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 9, PAGE NO 39**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Minister, perhaps you can provide a breakdown, on notice, of where the innovation funding is being provided to and what part of Sydney.

**ANSWER**

Investment NSW delivers a range of innovation initiatives across local government areas, including Western Sydney.

The \$11 million Innovation Scaleup Fund is delivering support to NSW startups and scaleups to respond to the health and economic impacts of COVID-19 through initiatives including a series of Innovation District Challenges held across Sydney and regional centres, and a COVID-19-focused round of TechVouchers to help NSW businesses collaborate with research organisations on R&D projects.

The \$35 million Entrepreneurship and Innovation Ecosystem Action Plan is rolling out initiatives for startups and scaleups located in metro and regional areas. The first initiative announced under the Action Plan is the \$10 million Westmead Innovation Ecosystem Fund to activate the Westmead Health & Innovation Precinct.

The Western Sydney Startup Hub, located in Parramatta, is the new complement to the Sydney Startup Hub that recently celebrated its fourth year of providing space for start-ups and entrepreneurs.

The NSW Government has also committed over \$1 billion dollars to activate the Bradfield City Centre which is adjacent to the Western Sydney International (Nancy Bird Walton) Airport. This includes funding for enabling works, an Advanced Manufacturing Research Centre and for the pilot of the New Education and Training Model to foster innovation and skills development.

The Office of Chief Scientist and Engineer co-invests in innovation through initiatives such as the \$10.3 million Research Attraction and Acceleration Program for infrastructure projects, the \$5 million Physical Sciences Fund to commercialise technological innovation, and the \$24 million Small Business Innovation and Research program to accelerate R&D commercialisation.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 10, PAGE NO 43**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Did you get a real estate valuation done of the Barrack Street property?

STEPHEN BRADY: I would have to take that question on notice. We obviously have to provide a value of our land and buildings for our annual report, but I have to take it on notice in terms of Barrack Street.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: If you are doing that, could you also take it on notice for the Chullora, Loftus, West Wollongong, Quirindi, Glendale, Gosford, Richmond, Hornsby and Campbelltown sites?

STEPHEN BRADY: Will do.

**ANSWER**

Each year TAFE NSW undertakes financial revaluations of land and building assets to support accurate financial statements, as required by accounting standards and NSW Treasury.

TAFE NSW has not undertaken a market valuation of properties at:

- Bega Barrack Street
- Chullora
- Loftus
- West Wollongong
- Quirindi
- Glendale
- Richmond
- Hornsby
- Campbelltown.

TAFE NSW has a market valuation for the Gosford property, in line with plans for the campus redevelopment announced by the NSW Government in December 2021.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 11, PAGE NO 43**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Ms Tickle, you are probably the person to answer the more detailed HR questions. Do you know, over the last financial year, what proportion of advertised jobs on the mobility list were actually teaching jobs?

JULIE TICKLE: No, I would have to take that specifically on notice. I know over the last academic year we advertised around 305, I believe, full-time teaching positions. We had a campaign called Teach at TAFE, which attracted part-time casual teachers and assessors into industry skills area such as child care and construction. It was a very successful campaign, and I would be happy to provide those numbers if you are interested in those.

**ANSWER**

I am advised the proportion of teaching jobs on the redeployment list was zero. This is because there were no redundancies for teachers in the 2020/21 financial year.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 12, PAGE NO 47**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Sorry, it was written notice of a letter from the Minister saying he was sacked, is that right?

GEORGINA HARRISSON: A written notice under the Government Sector Employee Act, clause, I think it is, 41, but I can confirm that. Yes, I handed him a letter from the Minister and we had a conversation about how he intended to move forward and what his next steps would be, which included, I think, hoping that COVID would allow him to go back to Europe and visit his parents.

**ANSWER**

Mr Faurby was provided with written advice from the then Minister advising of the Minister's decision in relation to the termination of his employment in accordance with Schedule 1A, Section 3 of the TAFE Commission Act 1990, and Mr Faurby's contract of employment.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 13, PAGE NO 48**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Did they prepare the letter or did your department prepare the letter?

GEORGINA HARRISSON: My recollection is the department prepared the letter, but I will confirm that on notice.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Which department? Your department?

GEORGINA HARRISSON: My department. But can I please confirm that on notice? Because, as I said, I spoke to the Public Service Commissioner in relation to support for Mr Faurby, but I cannot right here right now confirm whether or not any of my team in their general day-to-day dealings with the Public Service Commission had any of those conversations.

**ANSWER**

The decision of the then Minister to terminate Mr Faurby's employment was operationalised by the Department. This included the preparation of Mr Faurby's termination letter by the Department.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 14, PAGE NO 50**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: I am going to ask where the restructure is up to. I might start with the workforce services branch. Where is that restructure up to?

STEPHEN BRADY: Just one moment, please.

JULIE TICKLE: I can provide that information if it is easier.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: That would be good, Ms Tickle.

JULIE TICKLE: The workforce services payroll, that group is in the outcomes part of the process, which means that not very long ago—I believe it was last week, but I will check that because the weeks are running into each other—that team was called together and provided the outcomes. The CMP was noted by the Minister, and we are moving through. Once that happens, all the employees that are impacted in that change are provided the outcome of whether or not their position has been matched to a new position. I will mention that there is very high matching in that group, so many people who are currently working for us will remain. Following that placement, we go through the four-step placement process.

**ANSWER**

I am advised the Workforce Services Payroll team were provided the outcome of the consultation process and details of the Final Change Management Plan and Thematic Responses on 22 February 2022.



**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 15, PAGE NO 51**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: No, I mean the specific criteria that vulnerable communities will be ring-fenced for deletion of government positions?

JULIE TICKLE: I will take the question on notice because I am not quite sure of the premise of the question. I will take it on notice and come back.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: What public sector policy are we talking about that says vulnerable communities as defined as 5,000 or less should be ring-fenced for job cuts?

JULIE TICKLE: I will happily take that on notice. I do not have it written down in front of me.

**ANSWER**

I am advised TAFE NSW has taken a proactive approach to protect jobs in vulnerable communities in line with the NSW Government's position on regional employment and the NSW Government's Regional Workforce Principles.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 16, PAGE NO 53**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: So can you provide us was a copy of the letter that you gave to Mr Faurby?

GEORGINA HARRISSON: As I said, I provided a letter to Mr Faurby from the Minister. It was provided to me from the Minister and I provided it to Mr Faurby. The Minister is the person who, under both the GSC Act and the TAFE Commission Act, is able to make decisions about the employment of the managing director of TAFE. I am very happy to take on notice and see what it is that we can provide in relation to that letter, wherever it may be held on record.

**ANSWER**

The Department of Education has advised that the letter contains personal information of Mr Faurby as it relates to his employment arrangements. As such it contains matters of privilege and it is not considered appropriate to release the letter such that it becomes a matter of public record.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 17, PAGE NO 53**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: All right. Ms Tickle, I ask you if you could to also review the files and see if you can provide the material that you have about the termination of Mr Faurby on notice?

JULIE TICKLE: Yes, certainly.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Including any communication, if there is, either with the Governor or with the Executive Council about the termination of Mr Faurby? You have to give a verbal response.

JULIE TICKLE: I am sorry, yes.

**ANSWER**

Refer to response Budget Estimates transcript question 16.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 18, PAGE NO 53**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: This question may be to you, Ms Tickle, or it might be to Mr Brady. How many job losses have there been at the Richmond TAFE in the past six months? Is it 12 or is it more than 12?

STEPHEN BRADY: Ms Tickle, do you have that detail?

JULIE TICKLE: No, I do not have the detail for job losses at Richmond TAFE and I would be happy to take the question on notice.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that one employee based at the Richmond campus chose to take a voluntary redundancy in the past six months.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 19, PAGE NO 54**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: I will make it simpler than that. Ignore the word "cancelled". How many ran in first semester last year that are not running in first semester this year?

STEPHEN BRADY: Ms Hosea, are you able to provide any detail?

KIRSTY HOSEA: I will take that question on notice and verify the number. However, what I will say is that we change, add and cancel courses as a normal course of practice at TAFE NSW. That is very much dependant on the number of class enrolments. As we said this morning when the Minister was giving testimony, there was a dramatic decline in the number of courses. We have taken a number of different efforts to increase the class size, whether that is through the Department of Education and trying to target school students in the YES program, whether it is through advertising, through non-nationally recognised programs and a whole host of others. We tried to run five, and they did not attract any volume of enrolments. Some of them did not have a single enrolment.

**ANSWER**

Certificate III in Performance Horse is not currently being delivered at TAFE NSW Richmond. TAFE NSW is in consultation about the future of this course.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 20, PAGE NO 55**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Mr Brady, what were the projected enrolments down at the Bega trades hub?

STEPHEN BRADY: I do not have that information available to me just now, Mr Shoebridge. I will have to take that question on notice.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Were the actual enrolments one-quarter of what you were projecting? One-third? You must have had reports to you about how distressing the low enrolments were.

STEPHEN BRADY: Mr Shoebridge, I do not have details on a specific campus-by-campus basis. As Ms Hosea was saying, that information does have us in a competitive situation. It would be of great assistance to our competitors, so we do not generally release campus-level information.

**ANSWER**

TAFE NSW operates in a competitive environment and does not provide student enrolment forecasts or student enrolment data by location. TAFE NSW provides enrolment data in its Annual Report.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 21, PAGE NO 58**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: There were a lot of positions deleted in that restructure. A hundred and sixty-eight is the number that I have. Is that correct?

JULIE TICKLE: I will have to take that on notice. I have the net reduction of 24 employees. But I will need to take the position number because I do not have the change management plan in front of me.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: What kind of roles were deleted? Are you able to give us some indication of the types of roles that were being deleted in that restructure? Given the scale—it has gone from 430 positions down to 262. That is a lot of people, a lot of positions that have gone from that structure. That is a lot of work. Where does all that work go? If it is being reallocated to the remaining positions, is that sustainable? What is not being done in that particular restructure that has enabled you to delete so many positions?

JULIE TICKLE: In terms of the positions, for accuracy, I would like to take it on notice because I have information about the current change plans for the Committee, anticipating your questions would be around the change plans in play. But I would be very happy to take that on notice. In terms of how work changes, quite often it is reorganisation of role types. When we are streamlining under One TAFE, we are able to move work around across the State in a more agile and student-focused way. That is what we have done in some of the other changes as well. For your specific question, I will need to take it on notice for accuracy.

**ANSWER**

I am advised the change management plan created a unified Facilities Management & Logistics service by reducing duplication and overheads, and to streamline management structures so that TAFE NSW can focus on frontline teaching.

The change plan included legacy Institute roles such as facilities officers, painters, and gardeners. This work continues in the organisation through the utilisation of whole of government service contracts, which allows TAFE NSW to monitor service availability and be agile in scaling services as needed based on demand.

The overall net impact as published in the Final Change Management plan is a reduction of 24 employees, and a reduction of 168 positions. Many of these positions had been vacant for a significant period of time as they were from legacy Institute structures and therefore not required.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 22, PAGE NO 59**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Does that cost continue with the People Matter survey, or is that provided by the Public Service Commission? Is it a cost recovery? How is that paid for?

JULIE TICKLE: I will have to take that on notice. My notes say our current spend per annum but, in terms of how that is broken up, I would have to take that on notice

**ANSWER**

I am advised there is no cost to TAFE NSW and other NSW Government agencies to participate in the People Matter Survey unless additional reporting is requested through the survey partner. TAFE NSW also continues to undertake a yearly pulse survey. The total cost for the People Matter Survey additional reporting and the Pulse survey is approximately \$55,000 per annum.



**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 23, PAGE NO 61**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Can you give us the number of actual positions on notice, if you do not have that data in front of you?

JULIE TICKLE: In terms of providing the information on notice, I believe I can for the full-time positions. So I will be able to say, of the 305, a number of those had several positions.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Ms Tickle, you provide what you can and, to the extent you cannot provide it, just briefly explain why.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that for the 305 full-time teacher advertisements in 2021, there were at least 348 positions.

I am further advised that a position count is not available for part-time casual teachers as a result of their unique recruitment method through a suitability list. Suitability list recruitment allows for candidates to be engaged into multiple positions (both known and unknown at time of recruitment) and for multiple candidates to be hired against the same position simultaneously and over time. As a result, the position number does not accurately represent need or utilisation in the same way a permanent or temporary recruitment with a specific position/s to be filled by a single candidate/s would.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 24, PAGE NO 61**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Do you know how many part-time casual teachers are currently teaching in excess of the full-time annual load, which I think is at 720 teaching hours?

JULIE TICKLE: I do not have that information in front of me, no.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Can you provide it on notice?

JULIE TICKLE: Yes, I can

**ANSWER**

I am advised that it is not possible to provide data at this stage in the current academic year, as 720 teaching hours is an annualised requirement.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 25, PAGE NO 63**

The CHAIR: Ms Tickle, what is the longest time that somebody has been a casual teacher for TAFE, as at today? Is it 10 years, 20 years, 30 years?

JULIE TICKLE: I do not have that information.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Will you provide that on notice?

JULIE TICKLE: I certainly can take the question on notice. I am unsure exactly what we can provide. I will certainly take the question on notice and endeavour to provide the answer.

**ANSWER**

I am advised the longest serving part-time casual teacher has a tenure of approximately 33 years and worked on average approximately 6 teaching hours per week during 2021. Employing casual teachers provides flexibility that some educators prefer, as it allows them to work in industry and allows TAFE NSW to employ current industry professionals.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 26, PAGE NO 63**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: I know that is how the process works. I am asking how many have found themselves in that situation? How many in the last calendar year found themselves in that situation?

JULIE TICKLE: I can take that on notice.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: I have asked you about temporary teachers. Could you also provide the information about permanent teachers?

JULIE TICKLE: Who have gone into excess teaching?

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Into excess.

JULIE TICKLE: Yes, I can.

**ANSWER**

I am advised there were 46 temporary teachers in mostly hard to fill specialised areas who agreed to teach in excess of the full-time annual load of 720 teaching hours during their contract of employment in 2021.

I am also advised there were 712 permanent teachers in mostly hard to fill specialised areas who agreed to teach in excess of the full-time annual load of 720 teaching hours in 2021.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 27, PAGE NO 63**

CHLOE READ: The program has delivered over 168,000 fee-free training places—that is at 15 February 2022. I do not have December in front of me.

CHLOE READ: We can take the figures as of December on notice, Mr Shoebridge.

**ANSWER**

At 22 March 2022, there have been over 189,781 enrolments in fee-free training places through JobTrainer/Skilling for Recovery.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 28, PAGE NO 64**

GEORGINA HARRISSON: Mr Shoebridge, if I could just finish. You referred to the \$600 million in your question which is why I sought to clarify.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: I know it was 318.

GEORGINA HARRISSON: I am really happy for us to provide you on notice the details of those courses where we may have seen people step away and those continuing courses. One of the key points Mr Collins is trying to get across is that a number of these courses have not yet completed so we would not know whether or not they have completed or dropped out at this stage.

....

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Ms Harrisson, did you want to add anything to that?

GEORGINA HARRISSON: Only, Mr Shoebridge, that we will take your question on notice about the completions and dropouts and continuations.

**ANSWER**

At 11 March 2022, 17,833 learners enrolled in TAFE for their training through JobTrainer/Skilling for Recovery had completed training, 7,100 had withdrawn from or cancelled their training and 63,175 learners had commenced training and were progressing through their study.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 29, PAGE NO 67**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: First of all, can you tell me how much went to TAFE and how much went to private providers? Then, to the extent that I asked you about completion rates, can you break that down between TAFE and private providers?

DAVID COLLINS: Can I take that on notice?

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: If you do not have it there, absolutely you can.

DAVID COLLINS: I do not have that detail, particularly the nuance around completion rates. I am happy to come back to the Committee with that.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Putting to one side completion rates, do you have a breakdown of how much went to TAFE and how much went to private providers?

DAVID COLLINS: I will have to take that on notice.

**ANSWER**

At 11 March 2022:

- 92,914 learners had enrolled in TAFE NSW while 89,730 enrolments were for other providers.
- 63,175 (84%) TAFE learners had commenced and were currently in training compared to 38,333 (42.7%) for other providers.
- 17,833 (19%) TAFE learners had completed their training compared to 51,397 (57%) for learners with other providers.
- 7,100 (7.1%) TAFE learners had withdrawn from or cancelled their training compared to 10,050 (11.2%) for other providers.

It is noted that TAFE has a higher rate of participation in long, full qualification courses compared to other providers, with three quarters of enrolments undertaken through TAFE being full qualifications.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 30, PAGE NO 67-68**

STEPHEN BRADY: We do not have detail on how much with Ernst & Young year on year for a number of years. We can take that question on notice.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: I am not limiting it to consultants, just to be clear. I think you understand that.

STEPHEN BRADY: Understood.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Could you give me that for the financial year ending June last year and, also, to date this year? And could you do the same in relation to Deloitte as well, Mr Brady?

STEPHEN BRADY: Happy to do so, Mr Shoebridge.

**ANSWER**

Refer to response to Question on Notice page 26 for spend on Deloitte and EY in FY20/21. With regard to FY21/22:

- Deloitte: \$ 11,012,382 (to 3 March 2022)
- EY: \$ 7,206,505 (to 3 March 2022)



**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 31, PAGE NO 68**

GEORGINA HARRISSON: Certainly, Ms Houssos. I also will be able to provide some context on the Multiversity from the Education side, as you indicate, for the aerotropolis. We are working with the NUW Alliance—the universities of Newcastle, New South Wales, Wollongong and western Sydney—and TAFE NSW, and there are already enrolments being received for that Multiversity.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: How many enrolments?

GEORGINA HARRISSON: I would need to take that on notice and can come back to you, but enrolments are open. Program offerings align with an R&D capacity being developed for application at the proposed advanced manufacturing facility to be located beside the new airport.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: On notice, can you tell me how many have enrolled and in what courses?

GEORGINA HARRISSON: I will take that on notice and come back to you with what we have, yes.

**ANSWER**

I am advised;

The NUW Alliance of universities report that the Multiversity has received 67 enrolments across six courses since its launch in June 2021 to 27 September 2021.

A breakdown of enrolments by course and university is in the table below:

<b>Delivering institution</b>	<b>Course name</b>	<b>Total enrolments</b>
University of Newcastle	Undergraduate Certificate in Construction Management	8
University of Newcastle	Undergraduate Certificate in Information Technology	4
University of Wollongong	Undergraduate Certificate in Science	4
Western Sydney University	Undergraduate Certificate in Cyber Security, Cyber Crime and Behaviour	28
Western Sydney University	Undergraduate Certificate in Environmental Sustainability	22
Western Sydney University	Diploma in Aerotropolis Industry 4.0 (Mechatronics Skills)	1
	<b>Total</b>	<b>67</b>

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 32, PAGE NO 68**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Are you able to tell me on notice how many MOUs are there currently for the aerotropolis site?

AMY BROWN: I will take that on notice. The last figure I heard was 18, but there may have been some signed in recent weeks or months. Again, it is not this Committee but it will be covered on Tuesday for the Minister for Western Sydney, where WPCA will be represented. I will take it on notice for the purposes of this Committee too.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: I am interested in totality. For some reason I was told 40. If you could give me a figure, that would be great.

AMY BROWN: Yes, that sounds fine.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: And a list of them?

AMY BROWN: Yes, that is very able to be provided. There are different statuses, almost, of MOUs. Some are more firm, if you will, in terms of the agreements that have been reached, and some are almost like informal partnerships to develop the city. We can provide them.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: If you can give me a list of the MOUs, what is the status of them and any other agreements that you have that have been established, just to get a clearer picture on what is actually in place, that would be really helpful. And, on notice, anything else that you would like to provide around innovation in that particular space would be really helpful.

**ANSWER**

The Western Parkland City Authority has over 30 non-binding commitments with industry partners, including the 18 initial non-binding commitments entered with Foundation Partners:

- Northrop Grumman Australia
- NUW Alliance & Western Sydney University
- Mitsubishi Heavy Industries Ltd
- SMBC Group
- Sydney Markets Limited
- Hitachi Ltd
- Vitex Pharmaceuticals Pty Limited
- Urban Renaissance Agency
- The University of Sydney
- National Space Innovation Hub (Space SMEs Hub) inc. CSIRO
- Australian Space Agency
- Samsung SDS
- SUEZ Group & Sydney Water
- BAE Systems Australia

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

- Sheffield Advanced Manufacturing Research Centre
- GE Additive
- DB Schenker
- Siemens Australia
- Quickstep
- Romar Engineering
- FedEx Express
- ABB
- Sims Metal
- University of Technology Sydney
- NEC
- Nepean Engineering
- Daikin
- Defence Materials Technology Centre
- Precision Metal Group
- Dassault Systemes
- Coles Group
- BluGlass
- DroneShield
- ANCA Pty Ltd.

The Western Parkland City Authority website provides an overview of a range of innovative projects being progressed in Western Sydney, including the New Education and Training Model and the First Building for the Bradfield City Centre. Information can be found at: <https://wpca.sydney/>.

Information regarding the Smart Western City Program, a commitment under the Western Sydney City Deal, is available on the Department of Planning and Environment website at: <https://www.dpie.nsw.gov.au/our-work/strategy-and-innovation/smart-places/smart-places-programs/smart-western-city-program>.

It was announced in July 2020 that the Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation (CSIRO) had entered discussions with the NSW Government to relocate up to 450 staff to the Western Sydney Aerotropolis. The Western Parkland City Authority is progressing these discussions with CSIRO with the objective of delivering a bespoke building within the Bradfield City Centre with collaborative workshop and meeting spaces alongside state-of-the-art facilities and laboratories.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 33, PAGE NO 69**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Could you provide, on notice, the list of where those 55 staff will be based?

AMY BROWN: Yes.

**ANSWER**

This question falls under the portfolio responsibility of the Minister for Enterprise, Investment and Trade, Tourism and Sport, and Western Sydney, and should be directed to him.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 34, PAGE NO 70**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: I am also mindful of not taking too much time, Professor. On notice, would you mind providing me with the list of the programs, the budgeted amount for each program and the expenditure to today's date?

HUGH DURRANT-WHYTE: Yes, I have it here. I was going to hand it out from a previous question. It appears to be Cabinet sensitive, so it has to go through the Minister first.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Okay.

HUGH DURRANT-WHYTE: But all the programs, despite it being Cabinet sensitive, are all on our web page with all of those details.

**ANSWER**

In 2021/22, the Office of the Chief Scientist & Engineer delivers the following grant programs totalling \$37.8 million:

- The Research Attraction & Acceleration Program - \$10.3 million
- Small Business Innovation & Research Program - \$12 million
- Quantum Computing Fund - \$3.5 million
- Bushfire Response Mission - \$7 million
- Emerging Industry Infrastructure Fund - \$4 million
- R&D Platform - \$1 million

The majority of grants are expended in the final quarter of each financial year after application and assessment processes are completed.

The Office of the Chief Scientist & Engineer is also managing program funding for:

- the Department of Health - RNA pilot manufacturing facility for NSW (\$96 million)
- the Department of Planning and Environment - Net Zero Industry and Innovation Program (\$15 million over nine years).

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 35, PAGE NO 71**

GEORGINA HARRISSON: I think this was a Treasury fund, Ms Houssos. I am very happy for us to see if we can get some information back to the Committee on notice from our colleagues at Treasury.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Sure.

CHLOE READ: I think a loan has been guaranteed under the scheme, but we will come back to you and confirm that.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Okay. If you can confirm the amount of the loan, that would be appreciated.

GEORGINA HARRISSON: We will provide what we can on notice. I am just conscious that we will need to go to Treasury to get that information.

**ANSWER**

The NSW Government has provided a guarantee under the NSW University Loan Guarantee Scheme.

The Loan Guarantee scheme is managed by NSW Treasury.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 36, PAGE NO 71**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Yes, that is totally fine. I have a question about the ACU campus at Blacktown. We talked about it in the context of the agreements. Are there any other initiatives to support that campus at the moment?

AMY BROWN: I cannot talk to whether there is anything in the specific agreement with ACU.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: No, I understand.

AMY BROWN: But I do not know if any of my colleagues have any other visibility that is specific to that campus.

GEORGINA HARRISSON: No, not with us. I am happy to come back on notice if there is any further information we can provide to you.

**ANSWER**

The Department of Education is not currently undertaking any specific initiatives in relation to the Australian Catholic University's Blacktown campus.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 37, PAGE NO 72**

STEPHEN BRADY: Thank you. Mr D'Adam, I think the point that Dr McNeill is making is that there are multiple managers in TAFE who are managing streams of work. It may well be that the conversations were had with Ernst & Young but not with Dr McNeill personally. We are happy to take the question on notice.

**ANSWER**

TAFE NSW did not receive any request from Ernst and Young for written approval.



**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 38, PAGE NO 72**

GEORGINA HARRISSON: Mr D'Adam, I wonder if it might be helpful if on notice we also provided you some about the Government procurement rules on subcontracting. I would be very happy to do that to ensure that you have all the information that you would need in this area.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: That would be helpful.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that an engagement under the NSW Government Performance and Management Scheme (SCM0005) uses standard scheme rules which all suppliers agree to as part of Scheme membership. Full Scheme rules are published on the [buy.nsw](http://buy.nsw.gov.au) website.

**QUESTION 39, PAGE NO 72**

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Will that review be made public?

STEPHEN BRADY: Can I take that on notice, Mr D'Adam? The only reason I do that is that I am not 100 per cent clear on whether it is going to form part of a Cabinet submission or not. I am happy to come back to you on that.

**ANSWER**

The TAFE NSW Community Service Obligation (CSO) Review will not be made public as it is commercial in confidence. TAFE NSW will report on outcomes funded by CSO as part of the 2022-23 Budget.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES – MARCH 2022**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TRAINING, SCIENCE, INNOVATION AND**  
**TECHNOLOGY**  
**TRANSCRIPT QUESTIONS**

**QUESTION 40, PAGE NO 76**

CHLOE READ: The list is more like a rolling list. It is not like a—so the National Skills Commission list, I believe, is refreshed annually, or that is the plan. It is a relatively new list. In between the times for the skills commission list there is a process where States and Territories can say "Actually, we need a particular thing added to that list." Our list is, sort of, reviewed in a more ongoing way. It is not annually developed.

GEORGINA HARRISSON: We are happy to provide on notice, Mr D'Adam, some of the criteria that go into the formation of that list and its review period, if that is helpful?

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Sure.

**ANSWER**

The NSW Skills List identifies the qualifications eligible for a government subsidy under the Smart and Skilled program. There are currently 672 qualifications on the list, which are reviewed regularly to ensure the List meets the changing skills needs of the NSW economy.

Industry Training Advisory Bodies, Registered Training Organisations, government agencies and other stakeholders are invited to submit applications up to twice per year to have qualifications added to the Skills List. To be considered for addition to the List, applications are assessed against the following criteria:

- continuing and future industry demand;
- strong employment outcomes;
- pathway to further study;
- entry level employment;
- regional economic development;
- support for small businesses; and
- participating by disadvantaged or equity groups.

Existing qualifications are flagged for review if they have low Smart and Skilled training activity and/or low student outcomes. The Department of Education then conducts data analysis and stakeholder consultation before a decision is made to either remove, retain or move these qualifications to a prequalified list.

The Department is in the process of enhancing its current methodology for maintaining the Skills List to make stronger use of new and existing data sources and ensure qualifications on the List continue to target NSW labour market needs and result in good student outcomes.